The Cost of Trump’s Deportation Budget to the Empire and Garden States

December 2017

By Make the Road New York and Make the Road New Jersey
I. INTRODUCTION:

After repealing Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA), the Trump administration is using DREAMers as a bargaining chip to reallocate billions of dollars to increase immigration enforcement and build a border wall. These budget priorities are a reflection of the same anti-immigrant rhetoric and platform that Trump launched on the first day of his campaign, and on which he has continued to double-down as President. Since taking office, Trump has sought to advance the cause of mass deportation in this country to tear apart millions of immigrant families. The budget is a critical piece of this effort. In order to stalk immigrants wherever they go, he believes that enforcement agencies need thousands more officers, detention beds, and physical barriers that block human beings from moving freely. In short, he needs a deportation budget to achieve his ends.

As Trump remains fixated on his anti-immigrant crusade, he has proposed a budget that would make massive cuts to public goods such as healthcare, education, transportation, housing, and environmental protection. Trump’s budget proposal would dramatically cut the federal agencies responsible for providing these critical services, putting millions of Americans at risk and undermining their access to opportunity. Here in New York and New Jersey, communities are in dire need of investment for everything from education to infrastructure to affordable housing. But Trump’s budget, which also promises enormous tax cuts to the wealthiest Americans, would invest in a deportation machine instead of these vital community needs.

This report evaluates Trump’s budget—including both the proposed increases to immigration enforcement and the proposed cuts to other federal agencies—and asks: what is the cost of Trump’s deportation-centered policies to New York and New Jersey? In particular, the report examines how much of our region’s taxpayer money would go to fund Trump’s mass deportation agenda. It concludes by comparing that amount to the proposed cuts in other agencies, and contrasting those proposals with other, more effective ways to use tax dollars to increase opportunity for all.

Analysis of Trump’s deportation budget proposals, applying New York and New Jersey’s share of federal tax revenue contributions, reveals that New York taxpayers would pay $447 million for Trump’s anti-immigrant crusade with New Jersey taxpayers kicking in additional $240 million. This comes to a total of $687 million for the Empire and Garden States in a broader proposal that would usher in enormous cuts in education, transit, and environmental protection funding. This $687 million is in addition to the billions of dollars in lost tax revenue and economic activity from immigrants in the region should Trump be permitted to enact his mass deportation agenda.
This report concludes with recommendations that all members of New York and New Jersey’s Congressional delegation should:

- Pass a clean DREAM Act\(^3\) and refuse to authorize any taxpayer funds for anti-immigrant budget proposals. This includes the following proposed allocations,\(^4\) which must be rejected:
  - $1.6 billion for construction of President Trump’s border wall;
  - $1.2 billion for additional beds in detention centers;
  - $186 million to hire 1,000 additional ICE officers and 606 support staff;
  - $100 million to hire 500 new Border Patrol agents; and
  - $132 million for E-Verify, an electronic employment eligibility verification system.
- Resist all proposed cuts to the Department of Education ($9.2 billion), Department of Transportation ($2.4 billion), Department of Housing and Urban Development ($6.2 billion), Department of Health and Human Services ($12.7 billion), and the Environmental Protection Agency ($2.6 billion).\(^5\)
- Maintain social safety net programs like food stamps and Medicaid at their current levels.
- Ensure that the federal budget invests in healthy, thriving communities throughout the region by fully funding education, healthcare, jobs, infrastructure, and affordable housing. Instead of ripping apart families, $447 million in New York could be used to expand Child Health Plus ($81 million),\(^6\) pass the NY DREAM Act ($27 million),\(^7\) expand restorative justice programs to sever the school-to-prison pipeline ($66 million),\(^8\) and create a universal youth jobs program in New York City ($163 million).\(^9\) In New Jersey, those resources, if delivered to the state, could fully fund universal pre-kindergarten ($103 million)\(^10\) and cover NJ Transit’s 2017 budget deficit ($35 million)\(^11\) for far less than that $240 million price tag.
II. How Trump Wants to Use the Region’s Taxpayer Money to Fund Mass Deportation

Since his inauguration on January 20, 2017, President Trump has made a dramatic expansion of immigration enforcement into one of his top priorities. While the linchpin of his political campaign was the promise to build a massive wall on the United States-Mexico border to deter immigrants from crossing into the United States, he has already launched a major escalation of internal immigration enforcement through home and workplace raids. Since taking office, he has signaled his ongoing commitment to this anti-immigrant agenda, pledging to dramatically increase the number of Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) and US Customs and Border Protection (CBP) officers. He has also sought to attack sanctuary cities and rescinded policies of the Obama administration to use discretion in enforcement, fueling an increase in ICE arrests by 40 percent.

During the first half of 2017, more and more immigrants have been taken from their loved ones and locked up in immigrant detention centers, often in substandard conditions. Since last October, at least 10 people have died in ICE custody, including a New Yorker detained in New Jersey, with several passing away in conditions that indicate systematic neglect.

New York and New Jersey alone have 13 immigration detention facilities that house individuals detained on civil immigration violations, and the region’s facilities transferred, deported, or released 17,472 people in Fiscal Year 2015. Many detainees are ineligible to be released on bond and must fight their cases for years while incarcerated. For detainees who are eligible to pay bond in order to be released, the cost is often excessive and prohibitive. Furthermore, immigrants are detained in abysmal conditions, where they often lack appropriate medical care and may endure strip-searches in order to see friends or relatives. Politicians should be working to end—not expand—this dehumanizing system.

Trump’s proposed budget for 2018 looks to add $5.6 billion to fund immigration enforcement by increasing the budgets of CBP, ICE, and US Citizenship and Immigration Services. While the House Committee on Appropriations has responded, the Senate has not. If the Department of Homeland Security’s full proposal were passed, they would spend:

❖ $1.6 billion for construction of President Trump’s border wall;
❖ $1.2 billion for additional detention beds;
❖ $186 million to hire 1,000 additional ICE officers and 606 support staff;
❖ $100 million to hire 500 new Border Patrol agents; and
❖ $132 million to expand E-Verify.

Below, we calculate the cost of this proposed budget to New York and New Jersey taxpayers. We do so by determining the percentage of US tax revenue paid by New York and New Jersey taxpayers, and then applying that to the total cost of Trump’s deportation budget. New York and New Jersey taxpayers provided 8.0 percent and 4.3 percent of the $3.3 trillion that the IRS collected in fiscal year 2016.
When we apply this percentage to the $5.6 billion price tag on Trump’s deportation budget, we find that the direct cost of Trump’s deportation-focused budget efforts is $687 million, with $447 million and $240 million coming from New York and New Jersey taxpayers, respectively.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total IRS Collection by State (Billions)</th>
<th>Percentage of Total US Tax Revenue</th>
<th>Cost of Deportation Budget Per State (Millions)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>New York</td>
<td>$266</td>
<td>8.0%</td>
<td>$447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Jersey</td>
<td>$143</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
<td>$240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Both States</td>
<td>$409</td>
<td>12.3%</td>
<td>$687</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: IRS

These figures only reflect the initial cost to taxpayers. Should President Trump’s budget be approved by Congress and the administration’s federal immigrant enforcement plan put into effect, New York and New Jersey stand to lose billions of dollars in tax revenue from immigrants in the region. According to the Institute for Taxation and Economic Policy, New York and New Jersey’s undocumented immigrants pay $1.1 billion and $587 million respectively in taxes each year, which would be in jeopardy. And, according to New Jersey Policy Perspective (NJPP), the state’s economy would lose 4.9% of its Gross Domestic Product without the undocumented immigrant population—the largest such loss in the 50 states. New York’s economy would shrink 3.0%.
III. Trump’s Proposed Cuts to Other Critical Agencies

Meanwhile, the Trump administration is also proposing dramatic cuts to other vital federal agencies that provide public goods like education, clean air, and public transportation. Data on these massive proposed cuts are below. The impact on our communities would be profound. With less money for public schools, our children would suffer. With cuts to our transportation infrastructure, much-needed repairs and upgrades would be delayed, and economic productivity would decline. With fewer resources for environmental protection, our health would be in jeopardy.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Department or Agency</th>
<th>2017 Budget (in billions)</th>
<th>Proposed 2018 Budget (in billions)</th>
<th>Proposed Cut (in billions)</th>
<th>Percent Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Department of Education</td>
<td>$68.2</td>
<td>$59.0</td>
<td>$9.2</td>
<td>-13.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Transportation</td>
<td>$18.6</td>
<td>$16.2</td>
<td>$2.4</td>
<td>-12.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health and Human Services</td>
<td>$78.0</td>
<td>$65.3</td>
<td>$12.7</td>
<td>-16.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing and Urban Development</td>
<td>$46.9</td>
<td>$40.7</td>
<td>$6.2</td>
<td>-13.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Protection Agency</td>
<td>$8.2</td>
<td>$5.7</td>
<td>$2.6</td>
<td>-31.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Office of Management and Budget

The consequences of these cuts for our communities would be dire. Hundreds of millions of dollars that go to vital programs for youth, working people, and families would be cut in this budget. And the social safety net would be utterly eviscerated, with the Center on Budget and Policy Priorities estimating an expected gap of $1.2 billion in New York and $306 million in New Jersey for food stamps alone. Furthermore, the $7.4 billion cut to the Department of Housing and Urban Development would likely increase homelessness and hardship significantly.

In short, at the same time that Trump proposes spending billions of dollars to erect a senseless border wall and dramatically expand an immigration enforcement force to separate immigrant families, he is proposing extreme cuts to government agencies and programs on which our communities rely—and from which our states need more investment, not less.

*The Cost of Trump’s Deportation Budget to the Empire and Garden States*
IV. Investing in Thriving Communities

Meanwhile, New York and New Jersey communities face critical needs that are not being met—and that the budget could help address. For the same $687 million that Trump would take from taxpayers, New York and New Jersey could go a long way towards investing in healthy, thriving communities through fully funding education, healthcare, jobs, infrastructure, and affordable housing.

While the following budget proposals are not an exhaustive list, each of these priorities would improve the lives of people in the region.

Instead of being used to rip apart families, $447 million in New York could:

❖ Expand Child Health Plus ($81 million): This proposal would expand New York’s universal coverage program to 90,100 more people by allowing them to stay on through age 29. This program ensures that New Yorkers who are ineligible for Medicaid and the state health care marketplaces do not fall through the cracks.
❖ Pass the NY DREAM Act ($27 million): Thousands of undocumented youth who graduate from high school every year cannot afford to attend college because they are ineligible for state-based financial assistance, such as the Tuition Assistance Program. The NY DREAM Act would allow undocumented students who meet certain criteria to apply for financial support and continue their educations.
❖ Implement restorative justice practices in all schools ($66 million in New York City). Instead of relying on suspension and expulsion that feed the school-to-prison pipeline, restorative justice programs address the needs of everyone impacted by an issue. Restorative justice makes schools safer through focusing on those harmed, everyone’s needs and obligations, and how the group can repair the damage.
❖ Create a universal youth jobs program in New York City ($163 million). With half of NYC youth being turned away from the summer jobs program in 2015, creating a universal program would ensure that all young people in the city have the opportunity to gain valuable work experience.

Similarly, in New Jersey, that $240 million could:

❖ Fully fund universal pre-k ($103 million): New Jersey’s 2008 School Funding Reform Act promised all three- and four-year-old children pre-k, but full funding requires additional support from the state. While the current program provides essential early education for thousands of children, it only reaches about half of the state’s target population.
❖ Cover NJ Transit’s 2017 budget deficit ($35 million): Chronically underfunded, NJ Transit could close its estimated 2017 budget deficit and improve its financial health with the money going towards Trump’s deportation agenda.
V. Conclusion and Recommendations

The data in this report demonstrate that Trump’s deportation budget, in addition to raising enormous ethical concerns, will impose significant costs on New York and New Jersey taxpayers. Trump is asking New York and New Jersey taxpayers to spend $687 million on his deportation agenda in addition to the billions of dollars that the region would lose in tax revenue and economic activity if he massively expands deportations. His agenda includes vicious attempts to separate immigrant families - spending billions from the federal budget to build a border wall and arrest, detain, and deport more immigrant mothers, fathers, sons, and daughters. At the same time, he has proposed cuts to public goods such as education, transportation, housing, and environmental protection. This runs contrary to the values and priorities of New York and New Jersey residents. Instead of spending billions on his anti-immigrant enforcement and border boondoggle, the Trump administration should invest in Empire and Garden State communities.

This report concludes with recommendations that all members of New York and New Jersey’s Congressional delegation should:

❖ Pass a clean DREAM Act before the end of 2017 and refuse to authorize any of the anti-immigrant budget proposals outlined above, namely:
  ➢ $1.6 billion for construction of President Trump’s border wall;
  ➢ $1.2 billion for additional detention beds;
  ➢ $186 million to hire 1,000 additional ICE officers and 606 support staff;
  ➢ $100 million to hire 500 new Border Patrol agents; and
  ➢ $132 million for E-Verify.

❖ Resist all proposed cuts to the Department of Education ($9.2 billion), Department of Transportation ($2.4 billion), Department of Housing and Urban Development ($6.2 billion), Department of Health and Human Services ($12.7 billion), and the Environmental Protection Agency ($2.6 billion).

❖ Maintain social safety net programs like food stamps and Medicaid at their current levels.

❖ Ensure that the federal budget invests in healthy, thriving communities throughout the region by fully funding education, healthcare, jobs, infrastructure, and affordable housing. Instead of ripping apart families, $447 million in New York could be used to expand Child Health Plus ($81 million), pass the NY DREAM Act ($27 million), expand models that sever the school-to-prison pipeline ($66 million), and create a universal youth jobs program in New York City ($163 million). In New Jersey, we could fully fund universal pre-k ($103 million) and cover NJ Transit’s 2017 budget deficit ($35 million) for less than that $240 million price tag.

Our communities do not want their tax dollars wasted on Trump’s hateful crusade. Instead, it’s time that the Trump administration—with the strong encouragement of New York and New Jersey’s Congressional delegations—pass a clean DREAM Act, stop its attacks on vital government services, and invest in a brighter future for families across the country.
Endnotes

7 Ibid.
9 Ibid.
25 Ibid.
27 Ibid.
29 Ibid.

The Cost of Trump’s Deportation Budget to the Empire and Garden States

8


